

The Matching Problem

Example (*The Matching Problem*)

Suppose that each of N men at a party throws his hat into the center of the room. The hats are first mixed up, and then each man randomly selects a hat.

(a) What is the probability that none of the men selects his own hat?

(b) What is the probability that exactly k of the men select their own hats?

Solution:

(a)

We first calculate the complementary probability of at least one man's selecting his

own hat. Let us denote by $E_i, i = 1, 2, \dots, N$ the event that the i th man selects his

$$P\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^N E_i\right)$$

own hat. Now, , the probability that at least one of the men selects his own hat, is given by

$$\begin{aligned} P\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^N E_i\right) &= \sum_{i=1}^N P(E_i) - \sum_{i_1 < i_2} P(E_{i_1} E_{i_2}) + \dots \\ &\quad + (-1)^{n+1} \sum_{i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_n} P(E_{i_1} E_{i_2} \dots E_{i_n}) \\ &\quad + \dots + (-1)^{N+1} P(E_1 E_2 \dots E_N) \end{aligned}$$

If we regard the outcome of this experiment as a vector of N numbers, where the i th element is the number of the hat drawn by the i th man, then there are $N!$ possible

outcomes. [The outcome $(1, 2, 3, \dots, N)$ means, for example, that each man

selects his own hat.] Furthermore, $E_{i_1} E_{i_2} \dots E_{i_n}$, the event that each of the n men i_1, i_2, \dots, i_n

selects his own hat, can select any of $N-n$ hats, the second can then select any of $N-(n+1)$ hats, and so on. Hence, assuming that all $N!$ possible outcomes are equally likely, we see that

$$P(E_{i_1} E_{i_2} \dots E_{i_n}) = \frac{(N-n)!}{N!}$$

Also, as there are $\binom{N}{n}$ terms in $\sum_{i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_n} P(E_{i_1} E_{i_2} \dots E_{i_n})$, we see that

$$\sum_{i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_n} P(E_{i_1} E_{i_2} \dots E_{i_n}) = \frac{N!(N-n)!}{(N-n)!n!N!} = \frac{1}{n!}$$

and thus

$$P\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^N E_i\right) = 1 - \frac{1}{2!} + \frac{1}{3!} - \cdots + (-1)^{N+1} \frac{1}{N!}$$

Hence the probability that none of the men selects his own hat is

$$1 - 1 + \frac{1}{2!} - \frac{1}{3!} + \cdots + \frac{(-1)^N}{N!}$$

which for N large is approximately equal to $e^{-1} \approx .36788$. In other words, for N large, the probability that none of the men selects his own hat is approximately .37.

(b)

To obtain the probability that exactly k of the N men select their own hats, we first fix attention on a particular set of k men. The number of ways in which these and only these k men can select their own hats is equal to the number of ways in which the other $N-k$ men can select among their hats in such a way that none of them selects his own hat. But, as

$$1 - 1 + \frac{1}{2!} - \frac{1}{3!} + \cdots + \frac{(-1)^{N-k}}{(N-k)!}$$

is the probability that not one of $N-k$ men, selecting among their hats, selects his own, it follows that the number of ways in which the set of men selecting their own hats corresponds to the set of k men under consideration is

$$(N-k)! \left[1 - 1 + \frac{1}{2!} - \frac{1}{3!} + \cdots + \frac{(-1)^{N-k}}{(N-k)!} \right]$$

Hence, as there are $\binom{N}{k}$ possible selections of a group of k men, it follows that there are

$$\binom{N}{k} (N-k)! \left[1 - 1 + \frac{1}{2!} - \frac{1}{3!} + \cdots + \frac{(-1)^{N-k}}{(N-k)!} \right]$$

ways in which exactly k of the men select their own hats. The desired probability is thus

$$\frac{\binom{N}{k} (N-k)! \left[1 - 1 + \frac{1}{2!} - \frac{1}{3!} + \cdots + \frac{(-1)^{N-k}}{(N-k)!} \right]}{N!} = \frac{1 - 1 + \frac{1}{2!} - \frac{1}{3!} + \cdots + \frac{(-1)^{N-k}}{(N-k)!}}{k!}$$

which for N large is approximately $e^{-1}/k!$. ■